

Award of the SERVICOM Index

Report of

**SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation of
Federal College of Education (FCE)
Zaria, Kaduna State, Nigeria**

May, 2019

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

SUMMARY OF SERVICOM COMPLIANCE EVALUATION OF FEDERAL COLLEGE OF EDUCATION (FCE,) ZARIA

Date of Evaluation: May 13 – 17, 2019

Score: 1.9 out of 4 (47.5%)

Ranking: Star (**)

Description: Fair

Findings

Strengths:

- The College utilizes a biometric data capture system to monitor attendance and staff movement. This is the first of its kind in all the Federal Colleges of Education around the Country. The records are analyzed and used for promotion of outstanding and punctual staff. Queries are also issued to defaulting staff
- Information on the College services was well disseminated through the following variety of ways; College Bulletin, Radio FM 93.7, electronic billboards, the student's handbook which was updated in 2018 etc. The respondents affirmed this and commended the efforts of management of the college
- The College has thoughtfully constructed several covered seating platforms with charging points and internet connectivity to enable students have a comfortable waiting area in the academic part while they wait for lectures and around the hostels as well
- A well-established active network of SERVICOM Committee members monitors performance and reports back to management on service delivery matters
- It was gathered from the respondents that there was a cordial relationship between the College and its host community in Gyelessu.

Weaknesses:

- The toilet facilities in the male hostel and the condition of the hostels visited were in deplorable state. The environment housing the toilets were dirty with offensive smell; the rooms were dirty. This has exposed the students to epidemics, communicable diseases which in turn hinder their academic performances
- There was no evidence of complaints' records in the Students Affairs Department which oversees the day to day management of hostels in the school and thus actions taken to remedy the cause of a justified complaint were not known to the students

- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, were not carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers, as such the College does not measure the impact of its service delivery on customers with the aim of improving its services
- Complaints received and their resolutions over a period of times were not published in the variety of publications the college has for purposes of service improvement
- There was no reward, performance based incentive or award given to staff for neither excellent performance nor 'extra' incentive for quality customer service, this discourages staff to put in their best in service delivery
- The College had not published and displayed its Customer Care Policy to guide staff on how to treat customers. As such, students are not aware of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff

Recommendations:

- The College Management should try all possible means to improve the conditions of the toilet facilities in the male hostel. Regular monitoring should be put in place to ensure that the environment housing the toilets is clean at all times. This will eliminate cases of communicable diseases which in turn will improve students' academic performance
- The Students Affairs Department which oversees the day to day management of College hostels should develop and display a complaints' record as well as actions taken to remedy the cause of a justified complaint. This would boost students confidence in the resolution of their complaints
- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, should be carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers. This would help the management know service delivery is impacting on the customers
- Complaints received and their resolutions over a period of time should be published in the variety of publications the college has for purposes of service improvement. This would boost the confidence of the students in the complaint management system of the college
- There should be reward, performance based incentive or award given to staff for excellent performance and 'extra' incentive for quality customer service, this enhances staff performance in their delivering of services
- The College's Customer Care Policy should be published and displayed to guide staff on how to treat customers. This would enable the students know of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff

Conclusion:

The SERVICOM index score awarded to the Federal College of Education (FCE,) Zaria is **1.9 out of 4 (47.5%)** which represents **Two star (**)** and indicates **'Fair'** service delivery. Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that Federal College of Education (FCE,) Zaria would aim at continuous improvement on the quality of service delivered to its customers if the recommendations contained in this report are faithfully implemented.

.

.

MAIN REPORT

1.0 Introduction

This is a report on the findings of a SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation of the Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria. Compliance has been measured against the SERVICOM Index, a yardstick for measuring the quality of service as delivered by Government through its various Ministries, Departments and Agencies.

The SERVICOM Index is predicated on the fact that:

- the ultimate purpose of governance is to serve citizens
- citizens have the right to be served right
- service is well delivered only when citizens are satisfied; and
- the Federal Government is committed to the provisions of SERVICOM (Service Compact with All Nigerians) as a programme to improve service delivery throughout the country

Customer satisfaction is the overriding consideration of service delivery. Extensive research, consultations and surveys have shown that customer satisfaction is broadly driven by several drivers, listed below. Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria has been evaluated for each of these drivers through customer interviews, discussions with staff, discussions with partners, review of key documents and observations made at service windows. The overall Index score for Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria has been calculated as a weighted average of the scores evaluated for each driver. The weight of importance attached to each driver is as follows:

- Service Delivery – 30%
- Timeliness – 24%
- Information – 18%
- Professionalism – 16%
- Staff Attitude – 12%

2.0 Acknowledgement

We acknowledge the co-operation of the following for their contributions in the course of the evaluation exercise:

1. Mallam Adamu Adamu Minister, Federal Ministry of Education
2. Professor Anthony Gozie Minister of State, Federal Ministry of Education
Anwuka -
3. Arc. Sonny Echono Permanent Secretary, Federal Ministry of Education

4. Prof. Bappa-Aliyu Muhammadu Executive Secretary National Commission for Colleges of Education
5. Dr. Abdullahi Ango Ladan Provost, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
6. Dr. Sulaiman Balarabe Deputy Provost, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
7. Alhaji Mohammed Sani Uwaisu Bursar, Federal College of Education (FCE) (FCE) Zaria
8. Dr. Jibil Lawal Registrar, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
9. Dr. Hadiza T. Mohammed Chief Librarian Officer, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
10. Avc. Uwani Ibrahim Sulaiman Director of Works, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
11. Alhaji Garba Dahiru Director Audit, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
12. Barr. Maryam M. Halilu Dean, Student Affairs, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
13. Dr. L.C.D Jackreece Medical Director, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
14. Mr. Sunday Bonghort Nodal Officer, Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria

3.0 Terms of Reference

The Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria was selected for evaluation following a Presidential directive that all Government Ministries, Departments and Agencies be evaluated for SERVICOM Compliance.

The Mandate of the SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation team is to identify those areas or action that can bring immediate or urgent improvement in services to citizens.

4.0 Methodology

Background of FCE Zaria

The Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria was established in 1962 with the mandate to serve Northern region and catchment areas as a tertiary institution by the Federal Government of Nigeria.

The College is surrounded by rural agrarian and artisan communities that have been positively impacted by its presence in the area. The institution also runs effective extension services through its Consulting Firm. Federal College of Education Consult (FM 93.7) and has encouraged economic information growth and social life in its catchment areas.

Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria was established to provide full-time courses in teaching, instruction and training in following areas:

- School of Education
- Early Childhood and Primary Education
- School of Languages
- School of Arts and Social Sciences
- School of Special and, Adult and Non Formal Education
- School of Sciences
- School of Undergraduate Studies
- School of Vocational and Technical Education

FCE Zaria is responsible for ensuring the following services amongst others:

- a) Teaching
- b) Research
- c) Community Service

The service windows of (FCE) Zaria, vary significantly. To get a good representation, we considered that we should inspect service windows that vary in:

1. Sizes (large or small)
2. Volume of Customers (High or Low)
3. Range of Services Provided (Full range of service or limited range of services)

Therefore the following service windows were selected for evaluation:

- Schools (Academics)
- Library Services
- Student Affairs
- Exams and Records
- Hostel Accommodation
- College Clinic

The SERVICOM team for this evaluation consisted of Two SERVICOM Officers, One MSU staff of the SERVICOM Unit in the Federal Ministry of Education, the Focal Officer of the college as observers.

Evidence was gathered at the service windows through Customer Interviews, discussions with staff and partners, review of key documents and general observations. Given the peculiar nature of the services provided by the FCE Zaria, it was also important to evaluate further evidence by administering questionnaires and conducting interviews with its partners. The website of SERVICOM office: WWW.SERVICOM.gov.ng and www.ncce.org were also used for the research.

The key documents reviewed include:

- Service Charter of Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria
- Minutes of Management Meeting (PSC, Stakeholders, College tetfund)
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Organogram/Administrative structure
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Student Handbook
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Copy of Presentation at SERVICOM Orientation
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Directory
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Complaint Book (SCRAR)
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Special Bulletin
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Annual report 2014
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(Condition and Schemes of Service for Colleges of Education in Nigeria)
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Visitors Form, Query Letters, Letters of Advice, Announce sale of Admission form, SERVICOM Unit Situation report,
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(Revised Condition of Service for Colleges of Education in Nigeria)
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Student` Affairs Division Job form
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Office of the Coordinator Teaching Practice Unit Introductory Letter, Evaluation form, Assessment form
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Report on Casual staff Attitude and Observation made by Environmental Sanitation task force.
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Strategic Plan 2016-2021

- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Staff Development Policy and Guidelines
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Self-Assessment form
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Sample of Biometric Attendance logs
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Systematic monitoring of Attendance to schedules
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Teachers Registration Council of Nigeria guidelines
- Federal College of Education FCE Zaria Programmed of Events Matriculation Ceremony 2018-2019

5.0 FINDINGS:

The findings presented in this section comprise of an Index score, observations on the Service Charter and on the quality of service delivery found at the several service windows.

5.1 Charter Evaluation

The evaluated service charter of the College is unsuitable

5.1.1 Findings on Service Charter

Introduction / Background

- The Service Charter does not contain how College staff will treat its clients

Service Provision and Delivery

- There are no bullet point on Service provision and Service Delivery Standards in the Charter

Grievance Redress Mechanism

- An explanation including who to complaint to is not stated, in (Page 25) e.g. contact person's name and phone number.
- Time limits for responses and available redress is not stated

Obligations

- The obligations of the College to its customers is not clearly stated

Stakeholders Participation

- There is no description of the way and manner in which various stakeholders are engaged in the delivery of effective and efficient services in Charter

Special Needs Provision

- There is no provision for special needs in the Charter and this shows that consideration is not given to all customer groups of the College

Existing Limitation

- Existing limitations that may impinge service delivery are not stated

Charter Review

- The probable date of next review of the Service Charter and the intended frequency of review is not stated

Others

- Contents of the Charter are not properly arranged

5.1.2 Recommendations for improving Service Charter

Based on the findings, the following recommendations are provided to assist the Federal College of Education Zaria to come up with a more realistic and customer-focused Service Charter:

Introduction / Background

- The Service Charter should contain guidelines on how College staff will treat its clients

Service Provision and Delivery

- Service standards which are Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Realistic and Time-bound should be set for services provided by the College. Where timeframe is involved, specific timeframe within which service is expected to be delivered, if service involves charges, state cost of service etc
- The system for monitoring performance against service standards of the College and subsequent publishing of results of such monitoring should be stated in the Service Charter: state timelines and frequencies of such activities for measurability e.g., stakeholders meetings holding on monthly or quarterly basis, monthly or quarterly publication of same etc.

Grievance Redress Mechanism

The complaints/ Grievance Redress Mechanism should be comprehensive with the following details:

- Contact details of complaints desk officer and Focal Officer e.g. phone number, Room numbers and e-mail addresses
- The complaint procedure should be detailed stating who to complain to, how to complain and the channel of complaint (e.g. through writing by post or e-mail and the person to address it to. This would inform complainants on the options available for lodging complaints
- The Service Charter should clearly state time of acknowledging complaints and time for its resolution so that customers are aware of timeframe for the circle of complaints handling
- There should be a list of available redress to guide service takers on expected resolutions e.g. apology, compensation, repeat of service, restitution etc.

Obligations

- The obligations of the College should be clearly stated as this would tell the customers what to expect from staff of the College when they come to take service.

Stakeholders Participation

- The method to be used in engaging stakeholders (e.g. stakeholder's participation) should be explained as well as the frequency of engagement e. g. monthly, quarterly, annually etc. This will indicate that the Management is not oblivious of the strategic importance of collaborating with its various stakeholders for effective and efficient service delivery

Special Needs Provision

- There should be a list of certain exceptional services rendered to service takers that do not fall into the usual categories for example information provided in other languages other than English Language such as Yoruba, Hausa, Ibo etc

Existing Limitations

- Limitations that may hinder effective service delivery of the College should be stated so that customers are aware of the College's constraint in rendering services

Review of Charter

- The Charter is an evolving document and should be reviewed regularly to reflect the current state of the Organization's services. In recognition of this, there should be a statement on the date of next review and the frequency of review to show that the College is committed to maintaining an up-to-date Service Charter at all times for example every two (2) years.

Others

The contents of the Charter should be properly arranged in the following order:

- Introduction/ Background
- Vision
- Mission
- Services Rendered
- List of customers (inter, intra and public)
- Performance targets
- Obligations of customers, Staff, Management, etc
- Complaints/Grievance Redress Mechanism
- Stakeholders participation in service provision
- Special needs provision
- Existing limitations
- Review of Charter

The evaluated Service Charter of Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria

Description: **Unsuitable**

5.2 Index Score

The table below summarises the result of the evaluation of the service windows. Based on the evaluation, we have calculated a score of Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria

The overall Index score for Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria is: **1.9 out of 4 (47.5%) Description: Fair**

	Score for (Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria)
Overall Index Score	1.9
Service Delivery	2.1
1 – Standards & practices / performance	2.2
2 - Reception experience	2.1
3 – Complaints & grievance redress	1.9
Timeliness	2.1
1–Standards& practice/performance	2.2
2 – Customer friendliness	2.0
Information	1.8
1 – Information	2.2
2 - Customer feedback	1.4
Professionalism	1.9
1 – Transparency	1.7
2 – Efficiency	2.0
Staff Attitude	1.4

- Scores are rounded to one decimal point.

5.3 Key Findings

The following observations have been made on the quality of service delivery provided by the service window evaluated, which we feel need to be addressed as a matter of urgency:

5.3.1 Service Delivery

- Quite a number of customers interviewed complained of delays in obtaining statements of results and rectification of errors in records
- Though the College has a staff development policy in place, frontline staff members have not been trained on complaints handling to enable efficiency and professionalism in the investigation and resolution of customer complaints
- In the Students Affairs Department which oversees the day to day management of hostels in the school, there was no record of complaints kept to enable prompt and proper resolution of frequently reoccurring complaints and to also enable Management establish a trend and remedy such from the root causes
- The condition of the hostels visited and the toilet facilities in the male hostel were in a deplorable state. The environment around the toilets and the rooms were dirty with an offensive smell. This exposed the students to communicable diseases and likely epidemics such as cholera which will hinder their academic performance

5.3.2 Timeliness

- Most of the students interviewed complained of late release of examination results. This makes it difficult for students to re-register failed courses before the time line for course registration expires. This sometimes results in carrying over such courses to the next session again

5.3.3 Information

- As at the time of the evaluation, the College did not have a published plan for systematic and regular consultations with students and other stakeholders using variety of most suitable ways of obtaining feedback to capture their views on services provided. For instance, the use of comment cards to determine how they feel about the service provision
- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, were not carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers, as such the College does not measure the impact of its service delivery on customers with the aim of improving its services

- Quite a number of students interviewed at the college did not know about SERVICOM or the principles of service delivery. Thus, they did not know they could complaint or comment on the quality of services delivered by FCE Zaria

5.3.4 Professionalism

- Only a few of the frontline staff were observed to be wearing identification tags around the college to enable proper identification and reduce the number of touts and miscreants
- Complaints received and their resolution over a period of time was not published in publications and bulletin of the college for purposes of service improvement
- Summary of budget and expenditure as well as the audit and annual reports which was stale were not provided in the public domain for the benefit of all stakeholders
- There was no reward, performance based incentive or award given to staff for either excellent performance or as an 'extra' incentive for quality customer service, this discourages staff to put in their best in service delivery

5.3.5 Staff Attitude

- The College has not produced, published and displayed its Customer Care Policy to guide staff on how to treat customers. As such, students are not aware of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff
- Though the nature of the teaching profession includes customer care training, most of the staff are yet to receive adequate customer care trainings to handle customers better
- Students complained that not all staff are polite, friendly and attentive to their needs or and this discourages them from forwarding complaints and challenges

6.0 Recommendations

The following recommendations are provided in order to suggest actions that can be taken which could directly lead to improvements in service delivery. In this report, we are unable to comment on general constraints relating to physical or human resources, or structural and systemic issues, which may impinge on effective delivery of services to the public.

6.1 Key Recommendations

6.1.1 Service Delivery

- The upgrade, capture and computerisation of student records should be hastened to enable quick access to students information and reduce errors, frequency of rectification of results and waiting time for transcripts
- Frontline staff members as a matter of urgency, need to be trained on

complaints handling and other service improvement matters to enable efficiency and professionalism in the investigation and resolution of customer complaints

- There is a need to maintain proper records of complaints received with dated details of resolution at all key service points. This will enable proper collation and analysis of the complaints received for management's consideration and resolution
- Despite the financial challenges experienced, it is important for the College to renovate the hostels and improve on the living conditions of the students for better and conducive learning environment. The possibility of constructing more toilet facilities in the male hostels and around the college should also be considered as a matter of urgency. The cleaning of the existing toilet facilities should be properly supervised to ensure clean and decent conveniences

6.1.2 Timeliness

- Standards stated for the release of examination results should be adhered to and detailed information should be circulated to students on what to do, who to see if their results are incomplete and other such critical information. Timelines for the release of examination results should be improved upon and adhered to. This will enable students to re-register failed courses promptly before the time lines for course registration expires.

6.1.3 Information

- Regular and systematic consultations with students and other stakeholders using variety of most suitable ways of obtaining feedback to capture their views on services provided need to be considered and implemented. This will enable Management of FCE Zaria have a first-hand feedback on quality of services delivered. It will also enhance engagement of all stakeholders in policy making and implementation.
- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, were not carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers, as such the College does not measure the impact of its service delivery on customers with the aim of improving its services. The use of comment cards to determine how customers feel about the service provision is another source of information
- Awareness of SERVICOM and its activities should be created among staff and customers of the College. This would help them know the importance of SERVICOM Initiative delivering of quality service

6.1.4 Professionalism

- All frontline staff should wear their identification tags while they are on campus. This should be enforced from the gate and will minimise the number of touts and miscreants who sneak into the campus to steal bicycles and motor bikes of staff and students

- Complaints received and their resolution over a period of time need to be periodically published in publications and bulletin of the college for purposes of service improvement and for the public to know that their comments and complaints are being acted upon
- Summary of budget and expenditure as well as the audited financial and current annual reports should be provided in the public domain for the benefit of all stakeholders and for purposes of transparency and accountability in line with Open Government Partnership as already adopted by the Kaduna State Government
- Regular and periodic award system should be established at College and Departmental levels to motivate and encourage staff to perform better. This will also enhance competitiveness in delivery of better service to the public

6.1.5 Staff Attitude

- The College's Customer Care Policy should be published and displayed to guide staff on how to treat customers. This would enable the students know of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff
- Customer care trainings should be encouraged both in-house and outside trainings to guide staff on best practices of handling customers better
- Staff should inculcate a polite, friendly and attentive approach to the needs of the customers and be aware that they are there to serve the public. This will encourage students come forward to complain and comment on quality of services

6.2 Service Improvement Planning

Although the question of how these recommendations might best be implemented is a management issue for Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria, the SERVICOM Office through the SERVICOM Institute will work with the Management of FCE, Zaria to develop and guide the implementation of appropriate Service Improvement Plans.

6.3 Conclusion

The SERVICOM Index awarded to Federal College of Education (FCE) Zaria, is **1.9 out of 4 (47.5%)** which represents **Two star (**)** and indicates **(Fair Service delivery)**. Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that Federal College of Education Zaria would aim at continuous improvement on the quality of service delivered to its customers if the recommendations contained in this report are faithfully implemented.