

Award of the SERVICOM Index

Report of

SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation of Federal College of Education (FCE, Technical) Gombe, Gombe State

February, 2019

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

SUMMARY OF SERVICOM COMPLIANCE EVALUATION OF FEDERAL COLLEGE OF EDUCATION (FCE, TECHNICAL) GOMBE

Date of Evaluation: February 4 – 8, 2019

Score: 1.7 out of 4 (42.5%)

Ranking: Star (**)

Description: Fair

Findings

Strengths:

- It was gathered from the respondents that there had been a cordial relationship between the College and its host community. For example, the inhabitants of the community have free access to the College bore-hole water
- The College management provided buses that offer shuttle services at reduce fares between the school and the surrounding areas where students live
- Hostels have registers where details of visitors are documented to ascertain who goes in, what time and time out
- Staff were attentive and were seen to provide prompt services to customers

Weaknesses:

- The standard timeline set for release of examination results was not documented, neither in the student handbook nor in the service charter. The non-communication of standards to the students makes it difficult for students to know what is expected from the Exams and Records Department concerning release of results
- The toilet facilities in the male hostel and the condition of the hostels visited were in deplorable state. The environment housing the toilets was dirty with offensive smell; the rooms were dirty and crowded. This exposes the students to communicable diseases which in turn may hinder their academic performance
- There was no evidence of complaints' records in the Students Affairs Department which oversees the day to day management of hostels in the school and thus actions taken to remedy the cause of a justified complaint were not known to the students
- The location of the SERVICOM Unit Office without widespread publicity within the college made it difficult for some students to complain when they experience service failure
- Students complained of continuous delay in processing of transcript. This at times frustrate their effort in gaining admission into other tertiary institutions of learning as well as creates anxiety and lack of confidence in FCE (Technical), Gombe service

delivery process

- Regular review of information on the College services was not carried out e.g. the last update on Nigeria Certificate in Education Minimum Standard for the Colleges of Education was in 2012, the student's handbook was updated in 2014, thus denying the students' knowledge on current information on minimum standards
- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, were not carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers, as such the College does not measure the impact of its service delivery on customers with the aim of improving its services
- Complaints received and their resolutions over a period of times were not published in the variety of publications the college has for purposes of service improvement
- There was no reward, performance based incentive or award given to staff for neither excellent performance nor 'extra' incentive for quality customer service, this discourages staff to put in their best in service delivery
- The College had not published and displayed its Customer Care Policy to guide staff on how to treat customers. As such, students are not aware of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff

Recommendations:

- The standard timeline set for release of examination results should be documented in the student handbook and in the service charter. The standards when documented would help the students know what are expected from the Exams and Records Department concerning timely release of results
- The College Management should try all possible means to improve the conditions of the toilet facilities in the male hostel. Regular monitoring should be put in place to ensure that the environment housing the toilets is clean at all times. This will eliminate cases of communicable diseases which in turn will improve students' academic performance
- The Students Affairs Department which oversees the day to day management of College hostels should developed and display a complaints' record as well as actions taken to remedy the cause of a justified complaint. This would boost students confidence in the resolution of their complaints
- The location of the SERVICOM Unit Office should be in a building where every student can have access and adequate publicity of its location make known to the students. This would ensure easy access to the SERVICOM Office
- The College management should put measures in place to reduce incidence of continuous delay in processing of student's transcripts. The earlier it is release to them would help to realised their purpose as well as reduce anxiety and lack of confidence in FCE (Technical), Gombe service delivery process
- The College management should regular review information of the College services. The update should be carried out to ensure that the students are abreast with the current trends in Education Minimum Standard for the Colleges of Education in

Nigeria. This would help students bench mark students in other colleges of education

- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, should be carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers. This would help the management know service delivery is impacting on the customers
- Complaints received and their resolutions over a period of times should be published in the variety of publications the college has for purposes of service improvement. This would boost the confidence of the students in the complaint management system of the college
- There should be reward, performance based incentive or award given to staff for excellent performance and 'extra' incentive for quality customer service, this enhance the staff performance in their delivering of services
- The College's Customer Care Policy should be published and displayed to guide staff on how to treat customers. This would enable the students know of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff

Conclusion:

The SERVICOM Index score awarded to the Federal College of Education (FCE, Technical) Gombe is **1.7 out of 4 (42.5%)** which represents **Two star (**)** and indicates **'Fair'** service delivery. Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that Federal College of Education (FCE, Technical) Gombe would aim at continuous improvement on the quality of service delivered to its customers if the recommendations contained in this report are faithfully implemented.

Main Report

1.0 Introduction

This is a report on the findings of a SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation of the Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe. Compliance has been measured against the SERVICOM Index, a yardstick for measuring the quality of service as delivered by Government through its various Ministries, Departments and Agencies.

The SERVICOM Index is predicated on the facts that:

- the ultimate purpose of governance is to serve citizens
- citizens have the right to be served right
- service is well delivered only when citizens are satisfied; and
- the Federal Government is committed to the provisions of SERVICOM (Service Compact with All Nigerians) as a programme to improve service delivery throughout the country

Customer satisfaction is the overriding consideration of service delivery. Extensive research, consultations and surveys have shown that customer satisfaction is broadly driven by several drivers, listed below. Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe has been evaluated for each of these drivers through customer interviews, discussions with staff, discussions with partners, review of key documents and observations made at service windows. The overall Index score for Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe has been calculated as a weighted average of the scores evaluated for each driver. The weight of importance attached to each driver is as follows:

- Service Delivery – 30%
- Timeliness – 24%
- Information – 18%
- Professionalism – 16%
- Staff Attitude – 12%

2.0 Acknowledgement

We acknowledge the co-operation of the following for their contributions in the course of the evaluation exercise:

- | | | |
|----|--------------------------------|--|
| 1. | Mallam Adamu Adamu | Minister, Federal Ministry of Education |
| 2. | Professor Anthony Gozie Anwuka | Minister of State, Federal Ministry of Education |
| 3. | Arc. Sonny Echono | Permanent Secretary, Federal Ministry of Education |
| 4. | Professor Bappa-Aliyu Mohammed | Executive Secretary, National Commission for Colleges of Education |
| 5. | Dr. Ali Adamu | Provost, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |

- | | | |
|-----|---------------------------|--|
| 6. | Dr. E.B. Arfo | Deputy Provost, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 7. | Alhaji Mohammed M.Ibrahim | Ag. Bursar, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 8. | Alh. Umar M. Bello | Registrar, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 9. | Builder M Malam Ibrahim | Director of Works, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 10. | Mr A.K.M. Nasir Abubakar | Chief Nursing Officer, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 11. | Dr. Tijani Aminu Umar | Dean Student Affairs, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 12. | Dr. Adbulkadire A.B. | Dean, School of Business Education, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 13. | Mr. Idriss Muhammed | Dean, School of Education, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 14. | Mr. Abdulwahab | Dean, School of Tertiary Education, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |
| 15. | Mr. Sunday M. Thliza | Nodal Officer, Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe |

3.0 Terms of Reference

The Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe was selected for evaluation following a Presidential directive that all Government Ministries, Departments and Agencies be evaluated for SERVICOM Compliance.

The Mandate of the SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation team is to identify those areas or action that can bring immediate or urgent improvement in services to citizens.

4.0 Methodology

Background Information

The Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe was established in 1977 with the mandate to serve Gombe and catchment areas as a tertiary institution by the Federal Government of Nigeria.

The College is surrounded by rural agrarian and artisan communities that have been positively impacted by its presence in the area. The institution also runs effective extension services through its Consulting Firm, Gombe Federal College of Education Consult (GOFCECON) and has encouraged economic growth and social life in its catchment areas.

Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe was established to provide full-time courses in teaching, instruction and training in following areas:

- a. School of Technical Education
- b. School of Business Education
- c. School of Vocational Education:
- d. School of Science and Mathematics Education
- e. School of Primary Education

The Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe is responsible for ensuring the following services amongst others:

- a. Teaching
- b. Research
- c. Community service

The service windows of Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe vary significantly, to get a good representation, we considered that we should inspect service windows that vary in:

1. Size (Large reach out or Small reach out)
2. Volume of customers (High or Low)
3. Range of services provided (Full range of service or limited range of service)

Therefore, the following service windows (departments) were selected for evaluation:

1. Academics
 - Teaching Practice Department
 - Early Childhood
 - Basic school
 - Graduate Program in Education Department

2. Registrar's Office (Admission)
3. Exams and Records
4. College Library
5. Clinics
6. Bursary (Finance and Account)

The SERVICOM team for this evaluation consisted of two (2) SERVICOM Officers, Focal Officer FEC (T) and MSU staff of Federal Ministry of Education

Evidence was gathered at the service window through customer interviews, discussions with staff and partners, review of key documents and general observations.

Given the peculiar nature of the services provided by the FEC (T) Gombe, it was also important to evaluate further evidence by administering questionnaires and conducting interviews with its partners. The website of SERVICOM office: www.servenigeria.com and www.ncce.org were also used for the research.

The key documents reviewed include:

- Charter of Federal college of Education (Technical) Gombe
- Minutes of Management Meeting held on 25th April 2017
- Nursing and Midwifery Council of Nigeria (Certificate of Participation)
- Organization's Chart, (Student Handbook)
- Federal College of Education(Technical)NCE First Semester Lecture Time Table
- Federal College of Education(Technical) Teaching Practice Unit Student Posting
- National Health Management Information System Daily In-Patient Care Register
- Federal College of Education(Technical) Student Affairs Unit (Application for Accommodation)
- Federal College of Education(Technical) Gombe Academic Brief
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(Condition and Schemes of Service for Colleges of Education in Nigeria)
- Federal College of Education(Technical) Gombe Strategic Plan
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(Revised Condition of Service for Colleges of Education in Nigeria)
- Special Rules Governing Students stay in the Hostel
- Decree Establishing the College
- Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe Teaching Practice Cumulative Assessment
- Federal College of Education(Technical) Gombe Student Handbook
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(National Commission for College of Education Abuja Teaching Practice Supervisor`s Toolkit)
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(National Commission for College of Education Abuja PRE-NCE Minimum Standards for Nigeria Certificate in Education) 2012 Edition
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(National Commission for College of Education Abuja Nigeria Certificate in Education Minimum Standards for Arts and Social Sciences

- Education) 2012 Edition
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(National Commission for College of Education Abuja Nigeria Certificate in Education Minimum Standards for Vocation and Technical Education) 2012 Edition
- Federal Republic of Nigeria(National Commission for College of Education Abuja Nigeria Certificate in Education Minimum Standards for Early Childhood Care and Primary Education) 2012 Edition
- Clinic Staff Register

5.0 Findings

The findings presented in this section comprise of an Index score, observations on the Service Charter and on the quality of service delivery found at the service window.

5.1 Charter Evaluation

The evaluated Service Charter of Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe

Description: **Unsuitable**

5.1.1 Findings on the Service Charter

The following observations have been made on the Service Charter of the Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe:

Introduction

- The statement of the Charter is not clear how the College intends to achieve its mandate
- The Service Charter does not covered how College staff will treat its clients

Service Provision & Delivery

- There is no bullet point on Service provision and Service Delivery Standards in the Charter

Obligations of the Agency

- The obligations of the College to its customers is not clearly stated

Grievance Redress Mechanism

- Explanations include who to complaint to is not stated, in (Page 4) e.g person name and phone number.
- Time limit for responses and available redress is not stated

Stakeholder Participation

- There is no description of the way and manner in which various stakeholders are engaged in the delivery of effective and efficient services in
- No essential element in providing services

Special Needs Provision

- There is no provision for special needs in the Charter and this shows that consideration

is not given to all customer group of the College

Existing Limitation

- Existing limitations that may impinge service delivery are not stated

Review of Charter

- The probable date of next review of the Service Charter and the intended frequency of review is not stated

Others

- Contents of the Charter are not properly arranged

5.1.2. Recommendations for improving Service Charter

Based on the findings, the following recommendations are provided to assist the Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe to come up with a more realistic and customer-focused Service Charter:

Introduction

- The Service Charter should cover how College staff will treat its clients
- The statement of the Charter should include the mandate of the College intends to achieve

Service Provision & Delivery

- Service standards which are Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Realistic and Time-bound should be set for services provided by the College. Where timeframe is involved, specify timeframe within which service is expected to be delivered, if service involves charges, state cost of service etc
- The system for monitoring performance against service standards of the College and subsequent publishing of results of such monitoring should be stated in the Service Charter: state timelines and frequencies of such activities for measurability e.g., stakeholders meetings holding on monthly or quarterly basis, monthly or quarterly publication of same etc.

Obligations of the College

- The obligations of the College should be clearly stated as this would tell the customers what to expect from staff of the College when they come to take service.

Grievance Redress Mechanism

The complaints/ Grievance Redress Mechanism should be comprehensive with the following details:

- Contact details of complaints desk officer and Focal Officer e.g. phone number, Room numbers and e-mail addresses
- The complaint procedure should be detailed stating who to complain to, how to complain and the channel of complaint (e.g. through writing by post or e-mail and the person to address it to. This would inform complainants on the options available for lodging complaints
- The Service Charter should clearly state time of acknowledging complaints and time for its resolution so that customers are aware of timeframe for the circle of complaints handling
- There should be a list of available redress to guide service takers on

expected resolutions e.g. apology, compensation, repeat of service, restitution etc

Stakeholder Participation

- The method to be used in engaging stakeholders (e.g. stakeholders Politician) should be explained as well as the frequency of engagement e. g. monthly, quarterly, annually etc. This will indicate that the Management is not oblivious of the strategic importance of collaborating with its various stakeholders for effective and efficient service delivery

Special Needs Provision

- There should be a list of certain exceptional services rendered to service takers that do not fall into the usual categories for example information provided in other languages other than English Language such as Yoruba, Hausa, Ibo etc
- Lifts and Ram should be provided for the physically challenged

Existing Limitations

- Limitations that may hinder effective service delivery of the College should be stated so that customers are aware of the College's constraint in rendering services

Review of Charter

The Charter is an evolving document and should be reviewed regularly to reflect the current state of the Organization's services. In recognition of this, there should be a statement on the date of next review and the frequency of review to show that the College is committed to maintaining an up-to-date Service Charter at all times for example every two (2) years.

Others

The contents of the Charter should be properly arranged in the following order:

- Introduction/ Background
- Vision
- Mission
- Services Rendered
- List of customers (inter, intra and public)
- Performance targets
- Obligations of customers, Staff, Management, etc
- Complaints/Grievance Redress Mechanism
- Stakeholders participation in service provision
- Special needs provision
- Existing limitations
- Review of Charter

5.2 Index Score

The table below summarises the result of the evaluation of the service windows. Based on the evaluation, we have calculated a score of Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe

The overall Index score for Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe is: **1.7 out of 4 (42.5%) Description: Fair**

	Score for (Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe)
Overall Index Score	1.7
Service Delivery	1.6
1 – Standards & practices / performance	1.7
2 - Reception experience	1.9
3 – Complaints & grievance redress	1.3
Timeliness	2.0
1–Standards& practice/performance	1.7
2 – Customer friendliness	2.3
Information	1.4
1 – Information	1.6
2 - Customer feedback	1.3
Professionalism	1.8
1 – Transparency	1.5
2 – Efficiency	2.1
Staff Attitude	1.9

Scores are rounded to one decimal point.

5.3 Key Findings

The following observations have been made on the quality of service delivery provided by the service window evaluated, which we feel need to be addressed as a matter of urgency:

5.3.1 Service Delivery

- The standard timeline set for release of examination results were not documented either in the student handbook or the service charter. The non-communication of standards to the students makes it difficult for students to know what is expected from the Exams and Records Department concerning release of results
- The procedures for complaints/grievance redress mechanism did not include the name of Complaint Desk Officer as well as the office location. This made it difficult for some students and other customers who have genuine complaints on service failure to register their complaints
- There was no evidence of complaints' records in the Students Affairs Department which oversees the day to day management of hostels in the school and thus actions taken to remedy the cause of a justified complaint were not known to the students
- The toilet facilities in the male hostel and the condition of the hostels visited were in deplorable state. The environment housing the toilets was dirty with offensive smell; the rooms were dirty and crowded. This exposes the students to communicable diseases which in turn may hinder their academic performance
- Frontline staff members were not been trained on complaints handling. This results in mismanagement of complaints and affects the level of their professionalism in the investigation and resolution of customer complaints
- The location of the SERVICOM Unit Office without widespread publicity within the college made it difficult for some students to complain when they experience service failure.

5.3.2 Timeliness

- Students complained of continuous delay in processing of transcript. This at times frustrate their effort in gaining admission into other tertiary institutions of learning as well as creates anxiety and lack of confidence in FCE (Technical), Gombe service delivery process
- More than sixty percentages of the students as well as the examination officers interviewed complained of late release of examination results. This makes it difficult for students to re-register failed courses before the time line for course registration expires

5.3.3 Information

- Regular review of information on the College services was not carried out e.g. the last update on Nigeria Certificate in Education Minimum Standard for the Colleges of Education was in 2012, the student's handbook was updated in 2014, thus denying the students' knowledge on current information on minimum standards
- The College had not published plan for systematic and regular consultations with students and other stakeholders using variety of most suitable ways of obtaining feedback to capture their views on services provided. For instance, the use of comment cards to determine how they feel about the service provision

- Awareness of SERVICOM and its activities was very low at the time of visit among staff and customers of the College. As such, most of them were not aware of its importance and what the Initiative can do for them towards quality service provision.
- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, were not carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers, as such the College does not measure the impact of its service delivery on customers with the aim of improving its services

5.3.4 Professionalism

- Organizational charts were not displayed at service points to guide all customers and visitors to the College on the structure of the school. This affects the first time customers who find it difficult to locate the service points
- Summary of budget and expenditure as well as the audit and annual reports were not provided in the public domain for the benefit of all stakeholders
- Complaints received and their resolutions over a period of times were not published in the variety of publications the college has for purposes of service improvement
- There was no reward, performance based incentive or award given to staff for neither excellent performance nor 'extra' incentive for quality customer service, this discourages staff to put in their best in service delivery

5.3.5 Staff Attitude

- The College had not published and displayed its Customer Care Policy to guide staff on how to treat customers. As such, students are not aware of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff

6.0 Recommendations

The following recommendations are provided in order to suggest actions that can be taken which could directly lead to improvements in service delivery. In this report, we are unable to comment on general constraints relating to physical or human resources, or structural and systemic issues, which may impinge on effective delivery of services to the public.

6.1 Key Recommendations

6.1.1 Service Delivery

- The standard timeline set for release of examination results should be documented in the student handbook and in the service charter. The standards when documented it would help the students know what are expected from the Exams and Records Department concerning timely release of results
- The procedures for complaints/grievance redress mechanism should include the name of Complaint Desk Officer as well as the office location. This would make it easy for students and other customers who have genuine complaints on service failure to register their complaints
- The Students Affairs Department which oversees the day to day management of College hostels should developed and display a complaints' record as well as actions

taken to remedy the cause of a justified complaint. This would boost students confidence in the resolution of their complaints

- The College Management should try all possible means to improve the conditions of the toilet facilities in the male hostel. Regular monitoring should be put in place to ensure that the environment housing the toilets is clean at all times. This will eliminate cases of communicable diseases which in turn will improve students' academic performance
- Frontline staff members should be trained on complaints handling. This would enhance efficient resolution of complaints and improve students –staff relationship
- The location of the SERVICOM Unit Office should be in a building where every student can have access and adequate publicity of its location make known to the students. This would ensure easy access to the SERVICOM Office

6.1.2 Timeliness

- The College management should put measures in place to reduce incidence of continuous delay in processing of student's transcripts. The earlier it is released to them would help to realised their purpose as well as reduce anxiety and lack of confidence in FCE (Technical), Gombe service delivery process
- The College management should put measure in place to reduce frequent cases of late release of results by examination officers. This would enable the students re-register failed courses before the time line for course registration expires

6.1.2 Information

- The College management should regular review information of the College services. The update should be carried out to ensure that the students are abreast with the current trends in Education Minimum Standard for the Colleges of Education in Nigeria. This would help students bench mark students in other colleges of education
- The College management should published plan for systematic and regular consultations with students and other stakeholders using variety of most suitable ways of obtaining feedback to capture their views on services provided. This would help the college get feedback on its service provision
- Awareness of SERVICOM and its activities should be created among staff and customers of the College. This would help them know the importance of SERVICOM Initiative delivering of quality service
- Customer satisfaction surveys, covering all groups of its customers, should be carried out to test and determine the quality of services delivered to customers. This would help the management know service delivery is impacting on the customers

6.1.4 Professionalism

- Organizational charts should be displayed at service points to guide all customers and visitors to the College on the structure of the school. This ensure that the first time and subsequent customers find it easy locating service points
- Summary of budget and expenditure as well as the audit and annual reports should be in the public domain for the benefit of all stakeholders and to ensure transparency
- Complaints received and their resolutions over a period of times should be published in the variety of publications the college has for purposes of service improvement. This would boost the confidence of the students in the complaint management system of the college

- There should be reward, performance based incentive or award given to staff for excellent performance and 'extra' incentive for quality customer service, this enhance the staff performance in their delivering of services

6.1.5. Staff Attitude

- The College's Customer Care Policy should be published and displayed to guide staff on how to treat customers. This would enable the students know of what kind of treatment to expect from the staff

6.3 Service Improvement Planning

Although the question of how these recommendations might best be implemented is a management issue for Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe, the SERVICOM Office through the SERVICOM Institute will work with the Management of FCE (Technical), Gombe to develop and guide the implementation of appropriate Service Improvement Plans.

6.4 Conclusion

The SERVICOM Index awarded to Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe, is **1.7 out of 4 (42.5%)** which represents **Two star (**)** and indicates '**Fair Service delivery**'. Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that Federal College of Education (Technical) Gombe would aim at continuous improvement on the quality of service delivered to its customers if the recommendations contained in this report are faithfully implemented.