SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation Report of

Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria (FAAN), Murtala Muhammed International Airport Lagos State

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

SUMMARY OF SERVICOM COMPLIANCE EVALUATION OF FEDERAL AIRPORT AUTHORITY OF NIGERIAN (FAAN), MURTALA MUHAMMED INTERNATIONAL & DOMESTIC AIRPORTS, LAGOS STATE

Date of Evaluation: March 26. 27, 2018

Score: 2.2 out of 4 (55%)

Ranking: Star (**)

Description: Fair

Strengths:

- It was confirmed by staff that the sensitization exercise on effective service delivery conducted quarterly by the Customer care/SERVICOM Department has enhance their proficiency and sensitivity to customers while delivering service. This is commendable and should be sustained
- It was observed at the time of the evaluation that the Airports had sufficient signage which directed passengers to various service points.
- Provision of the Customer Service Lounge at both Terminals for the aged and physically/health challenged passengers depicts that FAAN takes into consideration all its customer groups in its service design
- The provision and publication of Hotlines at the airport for customers to call for inquiry and report service failure shows that FAAN is willing hear from its customers to improve service
- It was observed at the time of the evaluation and Passengers also confirmed that FAAN staff at the Murtalal Muhammed International and Domestic Terminals were friendly, polite and helpful. This is commendable as attitude to service is critical to attaining customer satisfaction.
- The provision of the level five (5) customer parking lot near the terminals show that FAAN considers the convenience of its customers over that of staff which is commendable
- The environment including the convenience at both terminals were observed to be in good state of cleanliness which adds to customersq reception experience
- Good lighting system was observed at the airport. This adds to good reception experience by customers
- Lagos Airport is certified in line with International Civil Aviation Organisations (ICAO) safety standards. This boost the confidence of passengers and FAAN stakeholders in terms of safety, security and facility usage of the Authority.

Weaknesses:

- Interviewed passengers at both terminals complained that announcement were not clear which led to a lot of passengers missing their flights. Thus customers bear additional costs and inconveniences of rescheduling flights
- The Cooling systems in both terminals were not effective (Especially the Alpha departure terminal of the domestic wing). This makes the environment unbearably hot for both passengers and other stakeholders at the airport.
- The travelator at the International departure wing and lifts (Only 2 out of 8 was functional) were not serviceable. Thus passenger had to strenuously climb stairs to the next service point.
- Majority of the X-ray baggage scanners in both terminals were single view and some at the International Wing unserviceable. This makes the screening process cumbersome and slow resulting to delay in service delivery.
- It was gathered from staff interview that there were no requisite modern security equipment to be deployed in the airport. Thus security and safety of passengers and other airport users is undermined
- The three Co-buses at the Domestic Airport for conveying passengers to and fro aircrafts were not functional. Hence, where the airlines failed to improvise, passengers are exposed to risk walking at the apron of the airport
- Flight Information Display Systems (FIDS) were not installed at the Domestic terminal and no constant status update on those installed at the International terminal.
- Information on service standards was not seen to be displayed at most service points for the benefit of the passengers. This inhibits passengers and other airport users taking informed decision while accessing service
- It was observed at the time of the evaluation that majority of the airport facilities e.g avio bridges, baggage conveyor belts, travelator, lifts, escalators, X-ray baggage scanners etc for customercs use were obsolete, unserviceable with frequent breakdowns and difficult to maintain. This does not guarantee pleasant service experience and results in delays
- Passengers of the International Terminal complained of constant harassment by the Nigerian Immigration Service and Nigerian Customs Service Officers in the bid to extort money and valuable goods from them. Thus passengers have lost confidence and trust provided in the services at the airport. e.g issue of hidden cost of \$1,000 per passenger with virgin passport
- It was discovered in the course of the evaluation that some key stakeholders (e.g Nigerian Immigration and Nigerian Custom Service, Quarantine, etc) did not keep to the terms of Executive Order 1 (EO) at the arrival screening points of the International Terminal. Thus passengers still go through the rigor of cumbersome inspections at the airport

Recommendations:

- Management of the Authority should ensure that quality public address systems are installed and maintained and the announcers professionally trained to announce information in a more audible manner. This will guarantee clarity of information for the benefit of all passengers. Options of predominant local dialect/pidgin English should be explored for improved customer sensitivity
- Management of FAAN should install effective central air conditioning systems (Chillers) at both terminals to give passengers and other stakeholders better reception experience
- Requisite modern travelators, conveyor belts, escalators and lifts should be installed and maintained at the International departure wing to enable all categories of passengers to have easy access to various service points.
- The management of the Authority should install and maintain sufficient modern double view X-ray baggage scanners, liquid scanners, body scanners etc, in the airport. This will facilitate safer screening process and timely service delivery.
- In line with best practice, requisite modern safety equipment such as automated access control systems (would limits physical contact with passengers); more CCTV cameras at perimeter fence and screening points, communication gadgets, etc at both terminals should be provided. This will enhance security and safety of passengers and other airport users
- The Authority should purchase more Co-buses and service the available three at the Domestic Airport to ensure effective conveyance of passengers
- Flight Information Display Systems (FIDS) should be installed at the Domestic Terminal with current status update in both terminals, to ensure that passengers are updated with current information on services of FAAN
- The reviewed service standards should be printed and displayed at all service points, to enable passengers and stakeholders take informed decision while accessing services of the Authority
- FAAN in liaison with the Ministry of Transportation and other relevant bodies should provide adequate and timely funds for the procurement of needed operational facilities. e.g. avio bridges, baggage conveyor belts, travelator, lifts, escalators, X-ray scanning machines, etc. This will enhance the effectiveness of the airport and improve quality service delivery to customers
- FAAN management in collaboration with the management of the Nigerian Immigration Service and Nigerian Customs Service should put a monitoring and reporting system in place to forestall extortion and seizure of valuable goods from passengers, by enforcing punitive measures to airing Officers. This would rebuild customers trust and confidence
- It is critical for Management of stakeholders (Especially Nigerian Immigration Service and Nigerian Custom Service) of the International Airport to ensure that on the field staff of their various organizations strictly adhere to terms,

conditions and directives of the Executive Order 1 (EO1). To ensure efficient, transparent and seamless service to passengers and stakeholders of the Authority

Conclusion:

The SERVICOM index awarded to Federal Airport Authority of Nigeria (FAAN) Murtala Muhammed International Airport, Lagos State is **2.2 out of 4.0 (55%)** which represents **Two Star (**)** and indicates '**Fair'** service delivery. Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that FAAN Management would aim at continuous improvement on the quality of service delivered to the public if the recommendations contained in this report are faithfully implemented.

MAIN REPORT

1.0 Introduction

This is a report on the findings of a SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation of the Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria (FAAN), Lagos. Compliance has been measured against the SERVICOM Index, a yardstick for measuring the quality of service as delivered by Government through its various Ministries, Departments, Parastatals and Agencies (MDAs).

The SERVICOM Index is predicated on the facts that:

- the ultimate purpose of governance is to serve citizens;
- citizens have the right to be served right;
- · service is well delivered only when citizens are satisfied; and
- The Federal Government is committed to the provisions of SERVICOM (Service Compact with All Nigerians) as a programme to improve service delivery throughout the country.

Customer satisfaction is the overriding consideration of service delivery. Extensive research, consultations and surveys have shown that customer satisfaction is broadly driven by several drivers, listed further below. FAAN, Lagos has been evaluated for each of these drivers through customer interviews, discussions with staff, discussions with partners, review of key documents and observations made at service windows. The overall Index score for FAAN, Lagos has been calculated as a weighted average of the scores evaluated for each driver. The weight of importance attached to each driver is as follows:

Service Delivery - 30%
Timeliness - 24%
Information - 18%
Professionalism - 16%
Staff Attitude - 12%

2.0 Acknowledgement

We acknowledge the co-operation of the following for their contributions in the course of the evaluation exercise:

a. Hon. Rotimi Amaech - Hon. Minister of Transportation

b. Sen Hadi Sirika - Minister of Aviation

c. Alh. Sabiqu Zakari - Perm. Sec. Min. of Transportation d. Engr. Sale Dunoma - Managing Director/CEO FAAN

e. Mrs. Agalasi E. Ehigie- Deputy Director, SERVICOM, Federal Ministry of Transportation

- f. Mrs. Ebele Okoye General Manager, Customer Service/SERVICOM Department, FAAN Headquarters
- g. Mrs. Shin-Aba V. Bamidele-Regional General Manager/Airport Manager
- h. Mr. Aderibigbe S.A. Domestic Terminal Manager, MMA
- i. Mr. Adekola A. Johnson GM SERVICOM Department, NCAA, Lagos

j. Mrs. Idoko Lorna - HOD, Customer Service/SERVICOM Department, MMA

3.0 Terms of Reference

FAAN was selected for evaluation following a presidential directive that all government Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) be evaluated for SERVICOM Compliance.

The mandate of the SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation team is to identify those areas or actions that can bring immediate or urgent improvement in services to citizens.

3.1. Background of FAAN

The Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria, a Parastatal of the Federal Ministry of Transportation (Aviation Sector), is vested with the responsibilities of developing a profitable management of customer-centric airports facilities for safe, secure and efficient carriage of passengers and goods at world class standard. The Authority was first established by Decree 45 of 1976 and was then known as Nigerian Airports Authority (NAA) and later had it functions re-aligned by Decree No.9 of 1996.

4.0 Methodology

The Federal Airport Authority of Nigeria, Murtal Muhammed International Airport (MMIA) is located in Ikeja, the Lagos State Capital. FAAN is a service organization statutorily charged to manage all Commercial Airports in Nigeria and provide service to both passengers and airlines. It generates revenue from both Aeronautical and Non-Aeronautical activities and provides services through several key Directorates and Departments as follow:

- a. Directorate of Airports Operations
- b. Directorate of Commercial Service and Business Development
- c. Directorate of Aviation Security
- d. Customer Service Department
- e. Environmental Department
- f. Mechanical Department
- g. Human Resources Department, etc.

FAAN, through its Directorates and Departments provide the following services to passengers and airlines:

- a. Provide safe environment for air transportation
- b. Provide accommodation and other facilities for effective handling of passengers and freight
- c. Develop and provide facilities for ground transportation
- d. Provide commercial services through concessionaires
- e. Prohibit installation of any structure which by virtue of its high position is considered to endanger the safety of air navigation

- f. Provide adequate conditions under which passengers and goods may be carried by air and under which aircraft may be used for other gainful purposes
- g. Charge for service provided by the Authority at airports
- h. Provide adequate facilities and Personnel for effective security at all airports, etc.

The service windows of FAAN vary significantly. To get a good representation, we considered that we should inspect service windows that vary in:

- Have high, medium or low volume of customers
- Provide full or limited range of essential services

Therefore FAAN, Murtal Muhammed International Airport was selected for evaluation in order to assess its 'passenger service experience from entry to exit'.

The SERVICOM team for this evaluation consisted of Two SERVICOM Officers, One MSU staff of the SERVICOM Unit in the Federal Ministry of Transportation, one staff of FAAN, MMIA and a Staff of Nigerian Civil Aviation Authority of Nigeria, Headquarters as observers.

Evidence was gathered at the service windows through Customer Interviews, discussions with staff and partners, review of key documents and general observations.

Other customers, staff or documents consulted

Given the peculiar nature of the services provided by FAAN, Murtal Muhammed International Airport, it was also important to evaluate further evidence by administering questionnaires and conducting interviews with its partners which included Nigerian Custom Service, Nigeria Immigration Service, NCAA, etc. The website of SERVICOM office: www.servenigeria.com and that of FAAN were also used for the research.

The key documents reviewed include:

- FAAN Charter
- FAAN Approved Budget for 2018
- FAAN Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December, 2017
- FAAN Budget Performance Jan- Aug, 2008
- Report on Staff performance evaluation(1st guarter of 2008)
- FAAN Training Records
- FAAN Conditions of Service, etc.

5.0 Index Score

The table below summarises the result of the evaluation of the service window. Based on the evaluation, we have calculated the score for **FAAN Murtala Muhammed International Airport, Lagos State**.

The score awarded to the FAAN Murtala Muhammed International Airport, Lagos State is: 2.2 out of 4 (55%) Description: fair

	Score for FAAN Murtala Muhammed International Airport, Lagos State	
Overall Index score	2.2	
Service Delivery	2.2	
1 - Standards & practices / performance	2.6	
2 - Reception experience	2.2	
3 - Complaints & grievance redress	1.7	
Timeliness	2.5	
1. Standards & practice/performance	2.5	
2 . Customer friendliness	2.5	
Information	1.9	
1 . Information	1.8	
2 - Customer feedback	2.0	
Professionalism	1.9	
1. Transparency	1.5	
2. Efficiency	2.3	
Staff Attitude	2.2	

5.1 Findings

The findings presented in this section comprise of an Index score and observations on the quality of service delivery found at the service window.

5.1.1 Service Delivery

- The Cooling systems in both terminals were not effective (Especially the Alpha departure terminal of the domestic wing). This makes the environment unbearably hot for both passengers and other stakeholders at the airport.
- The travelator at the International departure wing and lifts (Only 2 out of 8 was functional) were not serviceable. Thus passenger had to strenuously climb stairs to the next service point.
- Majority of the X-ray baggage scanners in both terminals were single view and some at the International Wing unserviceable. This makes the screening process cumbersome and slow resulting to delay in service delivery.
- It was gathered from staff interview that there were no requisite modern security equipment to be deployed in the airport. Thus security and safety of passengers and other airport users is undermined
- The three Co-buses at the Domestic Airport for conveying passengers to and fro aircrafts were not functional. Hence, where the airlines failed to improvise, passengers are exposed to risk walking at the apron of the airport
- It was observed at the time of the evaluation that the departure waiting area of Zulu hall of the domestic airport was dilapidated with incomplete Plaster of Paris (POP), warned out paintings and disorganized sitting arrangement. This negates good reception experience by passengers waiting to board their flights
- It was observed at the time of the visit that the Cargo Terminal of the International Airport was chaotic while the Domestic Cargo Terminal was unserviceable. This makes service experience hectic for customers in the former and total service failure in the later.
- There was no evidence of analyses of complaints received over a period of time at the evaluated Airports. Thus no means to determine trend of complaints for serviced improvement

5.1.2 Timeliness

 The baggage conveyor belts of both airports were old and warn out which delayed passengers who wait between 30 to 60 minute at the International Terminal to claim their baggage

5.1.3 Information

 Interviewed passengers at both terminals complained that announcement were not clear which led to a lot of passengers missing their flights. Thus customers bear additional costs and inconveniences of rescheduling flights

- The speakers at the office of the head of operations Domestic Terminal were faulty. Thus he could not hear announcements made and not informed on the on-going operations of the Terminal.
- Flight Information Display Systems (FIDS) were not installed at the Domestic airports and no constant status update on those installed at the International terminal
- Information on service standards was not seen to be displayed at most service points for the benefit of the passengers. This inhibits passengers and other airport users taking informed decision while accessing service
- Performance against standards was not available at any of the service outlets.
 Hence staff, passengers and stakeholders could not asses the Authority
 performance at a glance
- Though most of the service points that involved costs displayed their price list, it was observed at the time of the visit that same was not done at the trolley and some eateries service points. This gives room to hidden cost.
- General information to passengers was heard and seen only in English language. Thus the Authority did not consider the information needs of all customer groups.
- It was commendable that Customer Satisfaction Survey was conducted and analysed. However, there was no systematic publishing of the results for the benefit of the customers

5.1.4 Professionalism

- It was observed at the time of the evaluation that majority of the airport facilities e.g avio bridges, baggage conveyor belts, travelator, lifts, escalators, X-ray baggage scanners etc for customers use were obsolete, unserviceable with frequent breakdowns and difficult to maintain. This does not guarantee pleasant service experience and results in delays
- Passengers of the International Terminal complained of constant harassment by the Nigerian Immigration Service and Nigerian Customs Service Officers in the bid to extort money and valuable goods from them. Thus passengers have lost confidence and trust provided in the services at the airport. e.g issue of hidden cost of \$1,000 per passenger with virgin passport
- Passengers complained that for some services provided, there was preferential treatment (E.g dignitaries at screening and boarding points) when queuing up to receive service. Hence, felt unequally treated.
- The organizational structure of the Authority was not displayed at the evaluated Airports. Thus customers are not informed on the hierarchy of authority and the proper channel of communication in the event of service failure.
- Summary of complaints and details of actions taken to remedy complaints received over a period of time were not published. Consequently customers are not informed on trend of actions taken to resolve lodged complaints.

- It was gathered from majority of interviewed staff that the authority hardly gave incentives and rewards for good performance and this dampened staff morale for optimum performance
- The Directorate of Aviation Security was under staffed. This negatively affects
 the full discharge of staff duties. For example not all serviceable X-ray
 machines were manned at the time of the evaluation which led to long queues
 during screening
- Summary of budget and expenditure were not published for the benefit of the customers

5.1.5 Staff Attitude

Most of the interviewed frontline staff at the evaluated Airports confirmed that
they had not received refresher courses, on the job training as well as in
customer care and complaints handling aside from the in-house guidance on
the later. This affects their performance e.g. in handling and resolving
complaints

5.2 Additional findings

 It was discovered in the course of the evaluation that some key stakeholders (E.g Nigerian Immigration and Nigerian Custom Service, Quarantine, etc) did not keep to the terms of Executive Order 1 (EO) at the arrival screening points of the International Terminal. Thus passengers still go through the rigor of cumbersome inspections at the airport

6.0 Recommendations

The following recommendations are provided in order to suggest actions that can be taken which could <u>directly</u> lead to improvements in service delivery.

6.1 Key Recommendations

6.1.1 Service Delivery

- Management of FAAN should install effective central air conditioning systems (Chillers) at both terminals to give passengers and other stakeholders better reception experience
- Requisite modern travelators, conveyor belts, escalators and lifts should be installed and maintained at the International departure wing to enable all categories of passengers to have easy access to various service points.
- The management of the Authority should install and maintain sufficient modern double view X-ray baggage scanners, liquid scanners, body scanners etc, in the airport. This will facilitate safer screening process and timely service delivery.

- In line with best practice, requisite modern safety equipment such as automated access control systems (would limits physical contact with passengers); more CCTV cameras at perimeter fence and screening points, communication gadgets, etc at both terminals should be provided. This will enhance security and safety of passengers and other airport users
- The Authority should purchase more Co-buses and service the available three at the Domestic Airport to ensure effective conveyance of passengers
- The Zulu hall of the domestic airport should be renovated and better organized for good reception experience by passengers waiting to board their flights
- There is a dire need for an overhaul and reorganization of the Cargo Terminal
 of the International Airport and resuscitation of the Domestic Cargo Terminal
 for effective, efficient and seamless service to the customers.
- Complaints should be analyzed regularly, e.g. weekly, monthly or quarterly at the airport. This will identify recurring challenges or trends for immediate action and service improvement

6.1.2 Timeliness

 Modern baggage conveyor belts should be installed and maintained to ensure timely baggage claim by passengers.

6.1.3 Information

- Management of the Authority should ensure that quality public address systems are installed and maintained and the announcers professionally trained to announce information in a more audible manner. This will guarantee clarity of information for the benefit of all passengers. Options of predominant local dialect/pidgin English should be explored for improved customer sensitivity
- Quality speakers should also be installed and maintained at the office of the head of operations, Domestic Terminal to effectively monitor the on-going operations of the Terminal.
- Flight Information Display Systems (FIDS) should be installed at the Domestic airport with constant current status update in both terminals, to ensure that passengers are updated with current information on services of FAAN
- The reviewed service standards should be printed and displayed at all service points, to enable passengers and stakeholders take informed decision while accessing services of the Authority
- Performance against standards of FAAN should be made available at all service outlets, for passengers and stakeholders to assess the Authorityos performance at a glance
- Cost of services should be displayed at all service points that attract cost. (Including trolley and entry services), to avoid hidden cost and for passengers to have value for their money.

- In line with best practice, information should be in other languages in addition to English language. Particularly, French, Iyoruba, Hausa, Ibo, Pidgin English, Pictorial display, Translators for deaf & dumb. etc for the benefit of all customer groups
- The analysed results of Customer Satisfaction Survey should be published (In FAAN News Track and Service Outlets) so that passengers and stakeholders would be informed of their collective satisfaction level on service delivery performance of the Authority.

6.1.4 Professionalism

- FAAN in liaison with the Ministry of Transportation and other relevant bodies should provide adequate and timely funds for the procurement of needed operational facilities. e.g. avio bridges, baggage conveyor belts, travelator, lifts, escalators, X-ray scanning machines, etc. This will enhance the effectiveness of the airport and improve quality service delivery to customers
- FAAN management in collaboration with the management of the Nigerian Immigration Service and Nigerian Customs Service should put a monitoring and reporting system in place to forestall extortion and seizure of valuable goods from passengers, by enforcing punitive measures to airing Officers. This would rebuild customers trust and confidence
- The Authority should monitor and ensure that all passengers are treated equally for services rendered. Any dignitary in need of VIP treatment should be directed to the VIP Terminal where cost and charges apply.
- The organisational structure of the Authority should be displayed at service points to enlighten customers on the hierarchy of command in case they need to escalate service delivery issues or concerns
- Summary of complaints received and details of action taken to resolve complaints should be published for the benefit of customers. This will boost the confidence of passengers with justified complaints and assure them that their complaints will be treated.
- Management of the Authority should put a reward system in place to recognize and encourage good staff performance. E.g Reintroduction of the practice of end of year staff awards, display of picture of staff of the month, etc. This would highly motivate staff for better performance
- The Directorate of Aviation Security should be provided with adequate manpower to effectively and efficiently discharge it duties to customers and other airport users.
- To promote transparency in the expenditure of public funds, a summary of budget and expenditure of the Murtala Muhammed International and Domestic Airports should be published and displayed at strategic points for the benefit of the customers

6.1.5 Staff Attitude

 On the Job Refresher, Customer Relations and Complaints handling training should be planned and carried out for frontline staff of the Authority to equip them with the knowledge and skills to effectively carry out their jobs, interact with customers and boost the overall image of the Authority

6.2 Additional Recommendation

 It is critical for Management of stakeholders (Especially Nigerian Immigration Service and Nigerian Custom Service) of the International Airport to ensure that on the field staff of their various organizations strictly adhere to terms, conditions and directives of the Executive Order 1 (EO1).
 To ensure efficient, transparent and seamless service to passengers and stakeholders of the Authority

6.3 Service Improvement Planning

Although the question of how these recommendations might best be implemented is a management issue for Federal Airport Authority of Nigeria, Murtala Muhammed International Airport, Lagos State, SERVICOM Office through the SERVICOM Institute will work with the Management of FAAN and its Customer Service/SERVICOM Department to develop and guide the implementation of appropriate Service Improvement Plans.

6.4 Conclusion

The SERVICOM index awarded to Federal Airport Authority of Nigeria, Murtala Muhammed International Airport, Lagos State is **2.2 out of 4.0 (55%)** which represents **Two Star (**)** and indicates **'Fair'** service delivery. Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that FAAN would achieve continuous improvement on the quality of services delivered to the citizens if the foregoing suggestions are faithfully implemented.



Rating of SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation Scores (SCE) (Percentage, Ranking and Description)

_		
% Score	Ranking	Description
90 . 100%	5 Star Service	Praiseworthy*****
		(Has excelled at all aspects & criteria of Service
		Delivery)
70 . 89%	4 Star Service	Commendable****
		(Has all aspects & criteria of Service Delivery
		covered)
60 -	3 Star Service	Acceptable***
69		(Has most aspects and criteria of Service Delivery
09		covered but more could be done)
%		
40 - 59%	2 Star Service	Fair**
		(Some important aspects and criteria of Service
		Delivery are not covered and there is a lot more to
		be done to satisfy these requirements)
21 - 39%	1 Star Service	Poor*
		(Very little has been done to satisfy the aspects and
		requirements of Service Delivery)
0 - 20%	0 Star Service	Shameful
		(Nothing has been done to satisfy the aspects and
		requirements of Service Delivery)



ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I hereby acknowledge the receipt of a copy of SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation Report of the Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria, Murtala Muhammed International Airport, Lagos State conducted from 26th. 27th March, 2018.