### SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation Report of:

# Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria (FAAN), Mallam Aminu Kano International Airport Kano State

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### SUMMARY OF SERVICOM COMPLIANCE EVALUATION OF AMINU KANO INT. AIRPORT, KANO

Date of Evaluation: March 26-27, 2018

Score: 1.7 out of 4; (42.5%)

Ranking: Two Star Service

Description: Fair

**Findings** 

#### Strengths:

- As an evidence of a good collaboration, stakeholders, confirmed that they are consulted regularly on the service delivery process and systems aimed at improving services in the Airport
- Customers confirmed that staff are receptive and consider their plight a priority in the service delivery process, for example customers confirmed that staff of FAAN intervenes when other agencies try to extort money from them on arrival
- Information about services and how to access them are displayed for the information requirement of the customer
- Access to the Airport has been made easy for the public through provision signage and extensive labelling of offices

#### Weakness:

- Fire Tenders (Fire Cover) for the Airport are old and inadequate, thus depriving the airport and its users the needed guarantee services to be provided in case of an emergency
- Interactions with staff of the airport shows that cleaning contractors are not resident within the state where the airport is located, this makes it difficult for monitoring of those engaged by the contractors to clean the airport. This often leads to the airport surrounding kept unclean and untidy
- Conveniences are not well maintained. Most of the toilets are dirty, flooded and neglected as a result customers are not able to use them; this reduces customer reception experience
- Facilities such as conveyor belts and cooling systems are old as such do not function optimally. This leads to chaos especially when two aircrafts arrive simultaneously, the arrival hall gets stuffy and passengers wait endlessly for their luggage
- It was observed at the time of evaluation that the international arrival hall had no seats for passengers to seat and wait for their luggage. This leads to unpleasant experience as passengers had to seat on the second conveyor belt that was not in use and some passengers seat on bare floor
- There were no tables or platforms for arriving passengers to fill their immigration forms at the international arrival. This does not show that FAAN Kano Airport considers the plight of its customers
- It was observed that at the international arrival, officers of the Nigeria Customs

- service were seen extorting money from foreign passengers; this is disservice/colossal service failure to passengers and gives the country a negative image
- There is no system in place to monitor how long it takes for a Passenger to get his luggage when on arrival the airport; this keeps the passenger in suspense as to how long he/she has to wait to get his/her luggage; This causes endless waiting and anxiety
- Announcements made by the Information Desk are not made in plain language as it was observed and customers interviewed confirmed that the announcements are not clear and audible as a result many passengers miss their flights
- Cost of renting trollies are not displayed at strategic locations for the benefit of airport users e.g. the evaluation team was told cost of renting is three hundred naira (N300) only, but observed a trolley pusher negotiating two thousand naira (N2,000) for his services, this leaves passengers at the mercy of concessionaires
- The Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria Kano Airport has not adapted its information provision to meet special customer needs, e.g. information is not in Braille for the blind and not written in local languages for those who cannot speak or read English. This hampers access to service points by customers with special needs
- Training for staff of FAAN Kano Airport is not regular as most staff complained that they have not attended training since they were employed
- The Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria Kano Airport does not have a customer care policy in place to serve as proper guide for the equal treatment of all customers by the staff

#### Recommendations:

- Modern fire covers with three fire covers, an ambulance and a water tanker should be procured for the use of the airport. This will make the airport be prepared to deal with any eventualities that may occur
- The management of Federal Airports of Nigeria should ensure that does given contracts for the cleaning of the airports are resident in the state where the airport is located. This will ease monitoring of those engaged by the contractors to clean the airport and lead to a cleaner airport environment
- Conveniences, especially toilets should be maintained and kept clean for use by customers when nature calls
- The management of the airport should urgently upgrade facilities such as conveyor belts and cooling systems. This will help reduce the time it takes before passengers get their luggage when they arrive and also improve the service experience of all airport users
- Adequate seating arrangements should be provided for passengers in the international arrival hall. This will make them comfortable as they wait for their luggage
- Tables and other platforms should be provided at the international arrival hall

- for the use of passengers for filling of forms. This will alleviate the hardship faced when filling their forms
- Closed Circuit Television should be installed at the international arrival and other points in the airport. This will reduce incidences of extortion of passengers and aid monitoring of activities in the airport for improved transparency
- Standards should be set for waiting times. It should state how long a customer spends at each service point. This would promote prompt service, ensures efficiency and reduces delay at service points
- All frontline staff especially the ones that make announcements at the airport should be trained on how to make announcements in a plain language, this will minimize incidence where passengers miss their flights due to ambiguity in the announcements made
- Cost of renting trollies should be publicized at all service points and made available to customers to keep the customers informed on the cost of services and eliminate incidences where customers pay above normal rate
- The management of the Airport should take into consideration the information requirement of those with special needs such as translation of basic information into local languages, pictorial representations and Braille for the blind to ensure efficient service delivery to all customer groups
- Regular training and retraining should be provided to staff as at when due.
   This will enhance their skills and competencies to enable them operate in line with global best practices
- A robust customer care policy for the Airport should be designed and published to enhance standard treatment of all customers

#### Conclusion

The SERVICOM Index score awarded to the Aminu Kano International Airport, Kano is **1.7 out of 4 (42.5%)** which represent **Two star** and indicates **'Fair' service.** Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that the Aminu Kano Airport, Kano would achieve continuous improvement on the quality of service delivered to the citizen if the foregoing suggestions are faithfully implemented.

.

## MAIN REPORT

#### 1.0 Introduction

#### Introduction

This is a report on the findings of a SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation of the Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria (FAAN), Maiduguri. Compliance has been measured against the SERVICOM Index, a yardstick for measuring the quality of service as delivered by Government through its various Ministries, Departments, Parastatals and Agencies (MDAs).

The SERVICOM Index is predicated on the facts that:

- the ultimate purpose of governance is to serve citizens;
- citizens have the right to be served right;
- service is well delivered only when citizens are satisfied; and
- The Federal Government is committed to the provisions of SERVICOM (Service Compact with All Nigerians) as a programme to improve service delivery throughout the country.

Customer satisfaction is the overriding consideration of service delivery. Extensive research, consultations and surveys have shown that customer satisfaction is broadly driven by several drivers, listed further below. FAAN, Maiduguri has been evaluated for each of these drivers through customer interviews, discussions with staff, discussions with partners, review of key documents and observations made at service windows. The overall Index score for FAAN, Maiduguri has been calculated as a weighted average of the scores evaluated for each driver. The weight of importance attached to each driver is as follows:

Service Delivery - 30%
Timeliness - 24%
Information - 18%
Professionalism - 16%
Staff Attitude - 12%

#### 2.0 Acknowledgement

We acknowledge the co-operation of the following for their contributions in the course of the evaluation exercise.

1.	Hon. Chibuike Amaechi	Minister, Federal Ministry of Transportation
2.	Sen. Hadi Sirika	Hon Minister of State, Aviation
3.	Alh. Sabiu Zakari	Permanent Secretary, Transportation
4.	Engr. Saleh Dunoma	Managing Director & CEO, Federal
		Airports Authority of Nigeria
5.	Bello Mohammed Sabo	Regional Manager/ Kano Airport Manager
6.	Alivu Garba Abdullahi	Deputy General Manager Human

		Resources
7.	Alh. Ibrahim Chatta Nma	Deputy General Manager Commercial
8.	Engr. Z.D Umoru	Deputy General Manager Land, & survey
9.	Dr. M.S Danladi	Deputy General Manager Medical
10.	Aisha Y.M Bello	Head of Department Customer Service/
		SERVICOM
11.	Bulama Usman	Customer Service Department
12.	Shuaibu Ibrahim Gaza	Customer Service Department
13.	Abdulhamid M. Abdulahamid	Customer Service Department
14.	Salisu Bello	Customer Service Department

#### 3.0 Terms of Reference

The Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria (Mallam Aminu International Airport Kano) was selected for evaluation following a Presidential directive that all Government Departments and Agencies be evaluated for SERVICOM Compliance.

The Mandate of the SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation team is to identify those areas of actions that can bring immediate or urgent improvement in services to citizens.

#### 3.1. Background of FAAN

The Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria, a Parastatal of the Federal Ministry of Transportation (Aviation Sector), is vested with the responsibilities of developing a profitable management of customer-centric airports facilities for safe, secure and efficient carriage of passengers and goods at world class standard. The Authority was first established by Decree 45 of 1976 and was then known as Nigerian Airports Authority (NAA) and later had it functions re-aligned by Decree No.9 of 1996.

#### 4.0 Methodology

The Mallam Aminu Kano International Airport is located in Kano, Kano State Capital. FAAN is a service organization statutorily charged to manage all Commercial Airports in Nigeria and provide service to both passenger and airlines. It generates revenue from both Aeronautical and Non-Aeronautical activities and provides services through several key Directorates and Departments as follow:

- a. Directorate of Airports Operations
- b. Directorate of Commercial Service and Business Development
- c. Directorate of Aviation Security
- d. Customer Service Department
- e. Environmental Department
- f. Mechanical Department
- g. Human Resources Department, etc

FAAN, through its Directorates and Departments provide the following services to passengers and airlines:

- a. Provide safe environment for air transportation
- b. Provide accommodation and other facilities for effective handling of passengers and freight
- c. Develop and provide facilities for ground transportation

- d. Provide commercial services through concessionaires
- e. Prohibit installation of any structure which by virtue of its high position is considered to endanger the safety of air navigation
- f. Provide adequate conditions under which passengers and goods may be carried by air and under which aircraft may be used for other gainful purposes
- g. Charge for service provided by the Authority at airports
- h. Provide adequate facilities and Personnel for effective security at all airports, etc.

The service windows of FAAN vary significantly. To get a good representation, we considered that we should inspect service windows that vary in:

- Have high, medium or low volume of customers
- Provide full or limited range of essential services

Therefore FAAN, Maiduguri International Airport was selected for evaluation in order to assess its 'passenger service experience from entry to exit'.

The SERVICOM team for this evaluation consisted of Two SERVICOM Officers, One MSU staff of the SERVICOM Unit in the Federal Ministry of Transportation, Two staff from FAAN, Headquarters, a staff of FAAN, Maiduguri and a Staff of Nigerian Civil Aviation Authority of Nigeria, Headquarters as observers.

Evidence was gathered at the service windows through Customer Interviews, discussions with staff and partners, review of key documents and general observations.

#### Other customers, staff or documents consulted

Given the peculiar nature of the services provided by FAAN, Maiduguri International Airport, it was also important to evaluate further evidence by administering questionnaires and conducting interviews with its partners which included AZMAN Airline, Nigeria Immigration Services, NCAA, NAMA, DSS, etc. The website of SERVICOM office: <a href="https://www.servenigeria.com">www.servenigeria.com</a> and that of FAAN were also used for the research.

The key documents reviewed include:

- FAAN Charter
- FAAN Approved Budget for 2018
- FAAN Financial Statements for the year ended 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2017

#### 5.2 Index Score

The table below summarises the result of the evaluation of the service window. Based on the evaluation, we have calculated a score for Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria, Aminu Kano International Airport Kano. The overall Index score awarded to the Aminu Kano International Airport Kano is: **1.7 out of 4** 

#### (42.5 %) Two Star Service

Description: Fair

	Score for the Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria (Aminu Kano International Airport)
Overall Index score	1.7
Service Delivery	1.8
1 - Standards & practices / performance	1.8
2 . Reception experience	1.8
3 . Complaints & grievance redress	1.7
Timeliness	1.8
1 . Standards & practice/performance	1.3
2 . Customer friendliness	2.2
Information	1.6
1 . Information	1.6
2 - Customer feedback	1.7
Professionalism	1.5
1 . Transparency	1.2
2 . Efficiency	1.9
Staff Attitude	1.7

#### 5.3 Key Findings

The following observations have been made on the quality of service delivery provided by the Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria, Aminu Kano International Airport Kano which we feel need to be addressed as a matter of urgency.

#### 5.3.1 Service Delivery

- Fire Tenders (Fire Cover) for the Airport are old and inadequate, thus depriving the airport and its users the needed guarantee services to be provided in case of an emergency
- Conveniences are not well maintained. Most of the toilets are dirty, flooded and neglected as a result customers are not able to use them; this reduces customer reception experience
- Facilities such as conveyor belts and cooling systems are old as such do not function optimally. This leads to chaos especially when two aircrafts arrive simultaneously, the arrival hall gets stuffy and passengers wait endlessly for their luggage
- It was observed at the time of evaluation that the international arrival hall had
  no seats for passengers to seat and wait for their luggage. This leads to
  unpleasant experience as passengers had to seat on the second conveyor belt
  that was not in use and some passengers seat on bare floor
- There were no tables or platforms for arriving passengers to fill their immigration forms at the international arrival. This does not show that FAAN Kano Airport considers the plight of its customers
- It was observed that at the international arrival, officers of the Nigeria Customs service were seen extorting money from foreign passengers; this is disservice/colossal service failure to passengers and gives the country a negative image
- Facilities such as weighing scales are not adequate most times passengers
  luggage is estimated. This has lead to sharp practices by the airlines as a
  result of the shortage of weighing scales at the airport
- There is no queue rope to manage queues in the international airport. This may give room for shunting and rowdiness
- All frontline staff are not trained on complaints handling; this affects the level of their professionalism in the resolution and investigation of all customer complaints
- Records of analysis of complaints received are not kept, this denies the organisation and customers information on patterns of complaints received and may lead to reoccurrence of such complaints
- Interactions with staff of the airport shows that cleaning contractors are not resident within the state where the airport is located this makes it difficult for monitoring of those they employed to clean the airport. This often leads to the airport surrounding kept unclean and untidy

#### 5.3.2 Timeliness

- There is no system in place to monitor how long it takes for a Passenger to get his luggage on arrival at the airport; this keeps the passenger in suspense as to how long he/she has to wait to get his/her luggage and causes endless waiting and anxiety
- Customers complained that given the status of an international airport, the airport does not compare well with other international airports such as those from Sudan

#### 5.3.3 Information

- Announcements made by the Information Desk are not made in plain language as it was observed and customers interviewed confirmed that the announcements are not clear and audible as a result many passengers miss their flights
- Cost of renting trollies are not displayed at strategic locations for the benefit of airport users e.g. the evaluation team was told cost of renting is three hundred naira (N300) only, but observed a trolley pusher negotiating two thousand naira (N2,000) for his services, this leaves passengers at the mercy of concessionaires
- The Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria Kano Airport has not adapted its information provision to meet special customer needs, e.g. information is not in Braille for the blind and not written in local languages for those who cannot speak or read English. This hampers access to service points by customers with special needs
- There is no system in place to obtain feedback from customers on the services
  of the Airport e.g. there are no suggestion boxes, comment cards and other
  means of obtaining feedback on the services are not provided for customers
  use
- Customer satisfaction surveys were not carried out to test and determine the level of customersqsatisfaction with the services delivered in order to ensure that services are meeting customersqneeds

#### 5.3.4 Professionalism

- The cost of all services and the procedure for payment is not displayed at all necessary service points e.g. cost for trollies was not displayed at most service points. This could lead to hidden charges
- Organisational charts are not displayed at all service points so that the hierarchy of the organisation is known to customers to enable them know where to go for service as the need arises
- There was no evidence to show that summary of complaints received over a certain period are reviewed, attended to and published for customers to know that their complaints are being resolved
- Summary of budget, expenditure and report of audit were not published for the benefit of the customers for accountability and for transparency in delivery of services

- Training for staff of FAAN Kano Airport is not regular as most staff complained that they have not attended training since they were employed
- Most frontline staff do not wear name tags, offices and desks of all officers are not clearly marked to indicate their names and functions for easy identification by customers
- Most passengers interviewed were of the opinion that the services of FAAN are not efficient

#### 5.3.5 Staff Attitude

- The Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria Kano Airport does not have a customer care policy in place to serve as proper guide for the equal treatment of all customers by the staff
- All frontline staff are not trained on customer care; this affects their level of sensitivity to customers

#### 6.0 Recommendations

In this report, we are unable to comment on general constraints relating to physical or human resources, or structural and systemic issues, which may impinge on effective delivery of services to the public.

The following recommendations are therefore provided in order to suggest actions that can be taken which could <u>directly</u> lead to improvements in service delivery.

#### 6.1 Key Recommendations

#### 6.1.1 Service Delivery

- Modern fire covers with three fire covers, an ambulance and a water tanker should be procured for the use of the airport. This will make the airport be prepared to deal with any eventualities that may occur
- Conveniences, especially toilets should be maintained and kept clean for use by customers when nature calls
- The management of the airport should urgently upgrade facilities such as conveyor belts and cooling systems. This will help reduce the time it takes before passengers get their luggage when they arrive and also improve the service experience of all airport users
- Adequate seating arrangements should be provided for passengers in the international arrival hall. This will make them comfortable as they wait for their luggage
- Tables and other platforms should be provided at the international arrival hall for the use of passengers for filling of forms. This will alleviate the hardship faced when filling their forms
- Closed Circuit Television should be installed at the international arrival and other points in the airport. This will reduce incidences of extortion of passengers and aid monitoring of activities in the airport for improved transparency
- Adequate weighing scales should be provided for the airport. This will

- eliminate complaints by customers that they are short changed and also leads to transparency
- The management of the airport should provide a queue rope to eliminate incidence of shunting by passengers
- All frontline staff should be trained on complaints handling; this would enhance effective investigation, resolution and management of service failure at service points
- All complaints received should be recorded, analysed and published by management. This will give customercs confidence that their complaints receive attention
- The management of Federal Airports of Nigeria should ensure that does given contracts for the cleaning of the airports are resident in the state where the airport is located. This will ease monitoring of those engaged by the contractors to clean the airport and lead to a cleaner airport environment

#### 6.1.2 Timeliness

- Standards should be set for waiting times. It should state how long a customer spends at each service point. This would promote prompt service, ensures efficiency and reduces delay at service points
- To ensure that the airport compares well with other international airports in Sudan, facilities of the airport and the delivery systems should be improved upon so that the airport can compel well with airports of its kind

#### 6.1.3 Information

- All frontline staff especially the ones that make announcements at the airport should be trained on how to make announcements in a plain language, this will minimize incidence where passengers miss their flights due to ambiguity in the announcements made
- Cost of renting trollies should be publicized at all service points and made available to customers to keep the customers informed on the cost of services and eliminate incidences where customers pay above normal rate
- The management of the Airport should take into consideration the information requirement of those with special needs such as translation of basic information into local languages, pictorial representations and Braille for the blind to ensure efficient service delivery to all customer groups
- Facilities such as suggestion Boxes and comments cards used for obtaining feedback from customers aimed at improving services in the Airport should be provided for use of customers as this would enable management of the airport obtain feedback on the satisfaction level of customers
- Customer satisfaction surveys should be conducted regularly to determine the level of customer satisfaction and enable service improvement based on the results obtained

#### 6.1.4 Professionalism

- The costs and payment procedures for all services should be clearly displayed at all service points e.g. the cost for the use of trollies should be displayed. This will forestall the incidence of hidden costs to customers
- Organisational charts should be displayed at all service points so that the hierarchy of the Airport is known at a glance and all customers would know where to go when services fail
- Summary of complaints received and actions taken on justified complaints should be documented, periodically analyzed and the reports submitted to Management to help identify areas and trends of service failure and what to do to mitigate those failures towards citizen-focused service delivery
- Summary of budget, expenditure and reports of audit should be published and displayed in public domain to demonstrate transparency and accountability of the Aminu Kano International Airport, Kano to all customers
- Regular training and retraining should be provided to staff as at when due.
   This will enhance their skills and competencies to enable them operate in line with global best practices
- All frontline staff should wear name tags and also offices should bear the names and functions of the Officers occupying them. This will enable customers locate service points with ease
- The management of the Airport should as a matter of urgency improve on their facilities and the attitudes of sister agencies in the Airport to improve the perception of the customers about the Airport

#### 6.1.5 Staff Attitude

- A robust customer care policy for the Airport should be designed and published to enhance standard treatment of all customers
- Frontline staff should be trained on customer care; this will improve customer sensitivity of staff

#### 6.3 Service Improvement Planning

The SERVICOM Institute will work with the management of the Karshi General Hospital and the SERVICOM Unit of the Hospital to develop and guide the implementation of appropriate Service Improvement Plans.

However, the question of how these recommendations might best be implemented is a management issue for the General Hospital Karshi.

#### 6.4 Conclusion

The SERVICOM Index score awarded to the Federal Airports Authority of Nigeria, Aminu Kano International Airport Kano is: 1.7 out of 4 (42.5 %) which represent Two Star Service and indicates 'Fair' service. Although this is still far from praiseworthy, it is our belief that the FAAN, Aminu Kano International Airport, Kano would achieve continuous improvement on the quality of service delivered to the citizen if the foregoing suggestions are faithfully implemented.

.