SERVICOM Index Report

The People’s Right To Be Served Right

Evaluation of Lagos University Teaching Hospital,

Idi Araba, Lagos.

(Specialists Out-Patient Department)

Federal Ministry of Health

August 29, 2007

SERVICOM
2, Usman Dan Fodio Crescent, Zone A4,
Opposite State House Banquet Hall, Presidential Villa, Abuja, FCT
Tel: 09- 3140371-2, Fax: 09-3140373 P. M. B. 622, Garki - Abuja
E-mail: servicom@servenigeria.com
www.servenigeria.com
1.0 Introduction

This is a report on the findings of a SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation of Specialists Out-Patient Department of Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (hereinafter referred to as LUTH) of the Federal Ministry of Health. Compliance has been measured against the SERVICOM Index, a yardstick for measuring the quality of service as delivered by Government through its various Ministries, Departments and Agencies.

The SERVICOM Index is predicated on the facts that:

- The ultimate purpose of governance is to serve citizens
- Citizens have the right to be served right
- Service is well delivered only when citizens are satisfied; and
- The Federal Government is committed to the provisions of SERVICOM (Service Compact with All Nigerians) as a programme to improve service delivery throughout the country

Customer satisfaction is the overriding consideration of service delivery. Extensive research, consultations and surveys have shown that customer satisfaction is broadly driven by several drivers, listed below. The selected service window of the Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department) have been evaluated for each of these drivers through research, customer interviews, discussions with staff, discussions with partners, review of key documents and observations made at the service window. The overall Index score for Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department) has been calculated as a weighted average of the composite scores evaluated for each driver.

The weight of importance attached to each driver is as follows:

- Service Delivery – 30%
- Timeliness – 24%
• Information – 18%
• Professionalism – 16%
• Staff Attitude – 12%

2.0 Acknowledgement

We acknowledge the co-operation of the following for their contributions in the course of the evaluation exercise.

1. Prof. Akin Osinbogun Chief Medical Director, Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (LUTH)
2. Prof. J. K. Renner Chairman Medical Advisory Committee (CMAC)
3. Dr. M. O. Ogunlewe Deputy Chairman Medical Advisory Committee
4. Prof. B. C. Umerah Board Chairman, LUTH
5. Dr. Abdulrazzaq Gbadamosi Nodal Officer, MSU Federal Ministry of Health, Abuja.
6. Prof. Chris Bode Nodal Officer, Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (LUTH)
7. Mr. Babajide Grillo Principal Desk Officer, Parastatal SERVICOM Unit (PSU) LUTH
8. Mr. D. B. Oderinde Desk Officer, PSU LUTH
9. Mr. Uche Emekwe Desk officer, PSU LUTH
10. A.C. N.O Adejugbe Desk Officer, PSU LUTH
11. Mrs. T. O. Ladenika Desk Officer, PSU LUTH
12. Engr. O. S. Alabi Desk Officer, PSU LUTH
13. Mr. Tony Udoh MSU Staff, Federal Ministry of Health Abuja
3.0 Terms of Reference

The Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department) was selected for evaluation following a Presidential directive that all Government Departments and Agencies be evaluated for SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation.

The Mandate of the SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation team is to identify those areas of action that can bring immediate or urgent improvement in services to citizens.

4.0 Methodology

Lagos University Teaching University Hospital, Idi Araba (LUTH) provides services to the citizens through the following Clinical Departments/Schools:

- Medicine
- Obstetrics & Gynaecology
- Paediatrics
- Surgery
- Anaesthesia
- General Out Patient Department
- Community Medicine
- Institute of Child Health
- Physiotherapy
- Staff Clinic
- Radiodiagnosis
- Radiotherapy
- Morbid Anatomy
- Laboratories
- Pharmacy
- Nursing Services
Psychiatry

The Hospital also provides non-clinical services which ensure the smooth delivery of patients’ care. These include the Central Surgical Sterilizing Department (CSSD), Engineering, Medical Records, Laundry, Environmental Sanitation, Stores & Supplies, Orderlies, Maids, Attendants, Security Section, Catering /Dietetics and others.

In addition, LUTH runs a number of schools of allied medical disciplines.

- The School of Nursing and the School of Midwifery
- Schools of Post-Basic Nursing
- Nursing in Paediatrics
- A & E Nursing
- Theatre Nursing

Other schools include the School of Health Information Management, Laboratory Technology, Health Information and Management etc.

Lagos University Teaching Hospital (Specialists Out Patient Department) provides the following services:

- Registry: Collection of cards, retrieval of existing folders/Records
- Consultation: Medical Examination/Treatment
- Pharmacy: Drug Services, Drug costing and Dispensing
- Laboratory: Conduct Medical tests

We considered that the service windows of Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Iyi Araba vary significantly according to:

1. Volume of transaction
   - i. High
   - ii. Low

2. Range of services offered
   - i. Full range of services offered
   - ii. Limited range of services offered.

The Specialists Out-Patient Department was justifiably selected for the following
reasons:

- It is the first point of call and reception (gateway) for every customer to the Hospital
- It provides many range of services and has high volume of customers
- It serves as referral clinic for the various specialists’ and points of admissions for patient whose illness needs further attention
- It runs call services between 8am – 6pm daily
- The result of the evaluation can be used to bring about improved services to all its customers nationwide

The SERVICOM team for this evaluation consisted of two SERVICOM Officers, two MSU Staff of the Federal Ministry of Health, and the Nodal Officer of the Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba.

Evidence was gathered at the following service window through research, customer interviews, discussions with staff, discussion with partners, review of key documents and general observations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name and location of service windows evaluated</th>
<th>Date evaluated</th>
<th>With co-operation of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (LUTH) (Specialists Out-Patient Department) | 29/08/07 | • Prof. Akin Osinbogun (Chief Medical Director)  
• Prof. Chris Bode (Nodal Officer) |

4.1 Other Customers, Staff and Documents Consulted

Given the particular nature of the services provided by the Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department), it was also important to evaluate further evidence by administering questionnaires, and
conducting interviews with its partners including World Health Organisation (WHO) Nigeria Police, National Programme on Immunisation (NPI), Financial Institutions e.g. Union Bank, UBA and Guaranty Trust bank all within the hospital premises.

The website of SERVICOM office; www.servenigeria.com was also used for research.

The key documents reviewed include:

- Service Charter of the Hospital
- LUTH Annual Report
- LUTH Newsreel Official Journal
- Code of Conduct for staff handbook
- Minutes of SERVICOM interactive section meetings held with various department
- Minutes of management and staff meetings
- Minutes of Parastatal SERVICOM Unit (PSU) meeting
- Financial Report of Audit of the Hospital

5.0 Findings

The findings presented in this section comprise of an Index score, observations on the Service Charter and the quality of service delivery found at the service window. The table below summarises the result of the evaluation of the service window. Based on the evaluation of the service window, we have calculated a score for Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department).
5.1 Charter Evaluation

The evaluated score for the Service Charter of Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department) is one (1) out of three (3).

Description: Fair

Findings on Service Charter

- The Charter is not written in accordance with SERVICOM guideline
- No time frame is attached to the vision statement
- The Grievance Redress Mechanism does not clearly specify who to complaint to when services fail

Recommendations for improving Service Charter

- The contents of the charter should be properly arranged with specific details in the following order:
  - Introduction/Background
  - Vision
  - Mission
  - Services Rendered
  - List of customers (inter, intra and public)
  - Performance target/customers expectations
  - Obligations of customers
  - Complaints/grievance redress mechanism
  - Stakeholders participation in service provision
  - Special needs provision
  - Existing limitations
- There should also be time frame attached to the vision statement
- The complaints procedure should clearly state name, address and telephone numbers of officer whom complaints should be addressed to
- The Charter should also be simple, clear and realistic in its commitments
5.2 Index Score

The overall Index score awarded for the MDA is: **1.7 out of 4 (42.5%)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score for Lagos University Teaching Hospital, (LUTH) Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall Index score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - Standards &amp; practices / performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 – Reception experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 - Complaints &amp; grievance redress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timeliness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 – Standards &amp; practice / performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 – Customer friendliness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 – Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 – Customer feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Attitude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Scores are rounded to one (1) decimal place.

5.3 Key Findings

The following observations have been made on the quality of service delivery provided by Lagos University Teaching Hospital, Idi Araba (Specialists Out-Patient Department), which we feel need to be addressed as a matter of urgency

**Service Delivery.**
- There are no clearly defined processes involved in monitoring performance against **ALL** Set Standards to show that the organisation adheres to its set standards in rendering service to its customers
- Customers confirm that there are bureaucratic obstacles to access service e.g. too many processes before receiving actual service
- The waiting areas for the customers are inadequate, they are tight and some customers were seen standing
- There is no nominated complaints desk officer to whom complaints should be addressed when services fail
- Frontline staff have not been trained to receive and handle complaints and guidelines are not issued, this affects the level of professionalism in the resolution and investigation of all customer complaints

**Timeliness**
- Standards for waiting times are not set for initial and subsequent visits to the Specialists Out Patients Department as a result, customers experience delay at service points
- No system in place to monitor standard waiting times for services of the hospital. Therefore, results of monitoring are not recorded for benchmarking in the future
- Customers complain that staff do not offer explanations for delays in service (neither explain possible nor actual interruptions to service). This contributes largely to endless waiting time and increases customers anxiety

**Information**
- Information on standards on all major activities and for customer care are not widely available to customers and potential customers
- The hospital does not consider the information requirement of those with special needs i.e. the illiterate customers and the blind as such there is a problem of reading information provided this affects access to service
- Surveys are not carried out regularly to test customers’ satisfaction level as a way of measuring current level of performance. This affects service improvement in the hospital
- There are no records to show that consultation takes place between the hospital, customers and partners to determine the actual needs of customers and partners

**Professionalism**
- Appointment procedures are not clearly detailed at all service frontlines for the benefit of new and old customers alike. This makes it difficult for customers to access available services and leads to preferential treatment.
- Performance targets are not set for individuals and departments, therefore where there are variances in the overall targets of the hospital, it cannot be fully explained
- There are no records to show that business and improvement plans exist as such services in the SOPD are not reviewed regularly to ensure that the overall target set for the SOPD is achieved.

**Staff Attitude**
- There is no customer care policy produced and published to ensure that all
customers are treated equally

- Staff are not trained on customer care to ensure that customers are treated with sensitivity

5.4 Additional Findings
The following additional observations were also made on the quality of services delivered, which may also need attention.

Service Delivery
- There were complaints about the cost and charges of the service windows being too high. This was especially so for the very poor
- Convenience especially the toilets are not opened and maintained for use by customers this shows lack of sensitivity to customers need
- No refreshment facilities in the waiting area for the comfort of customers, this makes the customer to wander around the place in search of items to buy while waiting to receive service

Information
- There is no systematic publishing of the feedback and complaints gathered from customers to enable the public know that their comments are being acted upon

Professionalism
- Staff complained of not being motivated enough, this is partially as a result of the fact that good work is not commended, whereas staff are promptly disciplined when their performances are unsatisfactory
- Organisational charts are not displayed at all service frontlines for easy identification of service points
- Summary of budget, expenditure and audit reports are not published and provided in public domain for the benefit of all customers
- The existing structure of the Parastatal SERVICOM Unit (PSU) in LUTH is not in line with the set out SERVICOM standard for establishing SERVICOM Unit in MDAs
6.0 Recommendations

The following recommendations are provided in order to suggest actions that can be taken which could directly lead to improvements in service delivery. In this report, we are unable to comment on general constraints relating to physical or human resources, or structural and systemic issues, which may or may not lead to improvements in services.

The mandate of the SERVICOM Compliance Evaluation team is to identify those areas or actions that can bring immediate or urgent improvement in services to citizens. The question of how those actions might be best implemented is a management issue for the MDA that should be addressed with the guidance of the Ministerial SERVICOM Unit by developing Service Improvement Plans.

6.1 Key recommendations

Service delivery
- There should be clearly defined processes involved in monitoring performance against ALL Set Standards. This will ensure that set standards are adhered to for continuity of good service.
- Bureaucratic procedures which hamper easy access to service should be reviewed e.g. some processes should be streamlined for the benefit of the customer.
- Adequate waiting areas should be provided for the comfort of the customers.
- There should be a nominated complaint desk officer, who should be easily identifiable to all customers. This will make it easier for customers to complaint when they are dissatisfied with services rendered by the Hospital.
- All frontline staff should be trained on complaints handling, this will ensure that customers’ complaints are promptly and appropriately resolved.

Timeliness
- There should be publication of waiting times standard for first and subsequent visits these standards when implemented would promote prompt,
efficient and reliable service delivery especially at the service points

- A system should be put in place to monitor standard waiting time for timely and efficient performance of staff
- Staff should endeavour to give honest and substantial explanations for delays and interruption in service. This should be done as part of recovery of a breakdown to service delivery and will reduce the anxiety and anger of the customers

**Information**

- Information on full range of services provided by the hospital and when to access these services should be publicized for the benefit of customers, this will enable customers knows exactly what to expect from the hospital
- The hospital should take into consideration the information requirement of those with special needs such as the illiterate and the blind (e.g. some information can be provided in Braille for the blind) so as to serve all customers efficiently
- Customer satisfaction surveys should be carried out regularly to test customers’ satisfaction level this would encourage service improvement
- Results of consultation with customers and partners should be analysed and published. This would make it easier for the organisation to act upon the comments made and allow access to comments/resolution reached by the hospital

**Professionalism**

- Appointment procedures should be clearly detailed at all service frontlines, so that customers will be aware of all the steps to be taken in order to receive service
- Clear performance targets should be set for individual and department in order to monitor individual and department performance in the overall achievement of the organisation goal
- A business improvement plan should be put in place to review and improve services rendered to customers This would help in ensuring that the overall target set for services of the Specialists Out-Patient Department is met
**Staff Attitude**

- Customer care policy should be produced and published. This will further guide staff on providing quality service and ensure that customers are treated equally.
- All staff should be trained on customer care which should re-orientate them in their modes of relating with customers. More attention should be paid to the nurses as the complaints on bad staff attitudes were levelled against them.

### 6.2 Additional Recommendations

**Service Delivery**

- The hospital should look into the issue of complaints about its cost and charges, especially for affordability of the very poor.
- Conveniences should be put in functional state and accessible to customers for improved customer reception experience.
- The hospital should provide refreshment facilities, i.e. water dispensers at all patients' waiting area. This will assuage the thirst of patients while receiving service.

**Information**

- Resolutions of complaints and feedback received over a period of time from the customers should be published. This will make the customers build more confidence in the service delivery system.

**Professionalism**

- The hospital should take managerial (human resource management) measures to address the motivational issue of staff e.g. put in place a good reward system for outstanding staff.
- Organisational charts should be displayed at all service frontlines. This will equip customers with proper information on the hospital organisational structure.
- Summary of budget, expenditure and audit reports should be published and
placed in the public domain for the benefit of the customer. This will convince the customers and stakeholders that the hospital is accountable and transparent in its service delivery process.

- The existing structure of the Parastatal SERVICOM Unit (PSU) in LUTH should be re-arranged in line with the set out SERVICOM standard contained in the ‘Secretary to the Government of the Federation Circular of March 10th, 2005’ (SGF.19/S.48/C.2/283) for establishing SERVICOM Unit in MDAs. This will further facilitate effective and efficient service delivery.